

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions



**March 24, 2023**

### CONTENTS

#### NURSES

Mr. McKee  
Hon. Mr. Fitch  
Mr. McKee  
Hon. Mr. Fitch  
Mr. McKee  
Hon. Mr. Fitch  
Mr. McKee  
Hon. Mr. Fitch

#### BUDGET

Mr. Legacy  
Hon. Mr. Steeves  
Mr. Legacy  
Hon. Mr. Steeves  
Mr. Legacy  
Hon. Mr. Higgs

#### CULTURE

Ms. Thériault  
Hon. Ms. Scott-Wallace  
Ms. Thériault  
Hon. Ms. Scott-Wallace

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

### ENVIRONMENTAL TRUST FUND

Mr. LePage

Hon. Mr. Crossman

Mr. LePage

Hon. Mr. Crossman

Mr. LePage

Hon. Mr. Crossman

### ENVIRONMENT

Ms. Mitton

Hon. Mr. Crossman

Hon. Mr. Crossman

Ms. Mitton

Ms. Mitton

Ms. Mitton

Hon. Mr. Higgs

Ms. Mitton

Hon. Mr. Higgs

## Oral Questions

[Original]

### NURSES

**Mr. McKee** (Moncton Centre, Leader of the Official Opposition, L): Mr. Speaker, much has been said over the past week regarding nurse retention in the province, and it has become a major issue. We know that nurses are facing many challenges, including low wages, heavy workloads, and a lack of resources, and it is leading to increased burnout and nurses leaving the system. We know that nurses are taking on extra shifts to make up for the 1 000 vacancies that we currently face in the system.

Respect is a huge factor when it comes to job satisfaction, and right now, nurses do not feel respected by this government. They have now been facing shortages for many years, but it has only become worse since the pandemic, during which they had to work in very deplorable conditions. We should be thanking them for their service over those years, Mr. Speaker, but this government is not listening to nurses. They have now been lobbying for retention and incentive bonuses for over a year, but this government has not been listening. So why would nurses choose to stay here when this government does not show them the respect that they deserve?

**Hon. Mr. Fitch** (Riverview, Minister of Health, PC): Mr. Speaker, let me be very, very clear: We respect and appreciate the nurses here in New Brunswick. Let me be very clear, and let me be very concise: We appreciate all the frontline workers here in New Brunswick—the RNs, LPNs, PSWs, nurse practitioners, and physicians. And that goes beyond those walls as well, to social workers, firefighters, paramedics, police officers, and social workers who do child protection. We greatly appreciate all the work that has been done by all the frontline workers here in the province during COVID-19 and beyond. That was reflected in our budget, Mr. Speaker, and it is being reflected here on the floor of the Legislature. I cannot say it any clearer.

Again, if the opposition wants to discuss this, I will get into some of the details of what this budget contains to show that appreciation in a monetary way.

**Mr. McKee** (Moncton Centre, Leader of the Official Opposition, L): The members opposite can talk the talk, but the nurses do not feel the love from this government. That is what they are telling us, and that is what they are telling the media. It is well known. The members opposite can talk all they want about how they respect nurses, but their actions do not follow their words. They want to talk about what is in the budget. Well, what is not in the budget are the retention bonuses for which the nurses have been lobbying for over a year now.

It is not news to this government. I know that the minister said that he was surprised, but Newfoundland did it last summer. Nurses have been lobbying for a year now, and this government is falling behind. It has had huge surpluses over the past three years. It has the money for this kind of incentive, and it is not recurring spending, adding to years of

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

budgets. This is a onetime commitment that could be put in place if the government gave a retention bonus for nurses to commit to years of service. Is the minister concerned that if he does not step up to the plate, nurses are going to leave the province?

**Hon. Mr. Fitch** (Riverview, Minister of Health, PC): Mr. Speaker, thank you very much. Let me say again that we are always concerned about the decisions people make on where to locate, where to live and work. There is a flow in and out, and we are trying to encourage all types of health care workers to come and work here in the province, which does have a great work-life balance.

That is also what we heard from the nurses over the last year—talk about that work-life balance. How do we cope with the stress that we are working under? What we also hear is that the shifts are short of RNs and LPNs, so what we are doing is a substantial amount of recruiting—a substantial amount of recruiting that is having results. Those results are being felt because we just had a group arrive back from a mission in the Philippines, where over 500 people were interested in coming to New Brunswick. Of those 500 people, 200 were offered a contract, and we are having positive results. We will see, again, more people on the floor. Help is coming, and that help will be from the people that we have been recruiting.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. McKee** (Moncton Centre, Leader of the Official Opposition, L): Mr. Speaker, the minister talks about recruitment a lot, but he does not talk about retention. It is half the battle, because we know that we lose hundreds of nurses each year.

We are asking these health professionals to work more. They take on additional shifts and, on average, they work 10 hours of overtime per week. We are asking them to work more. If we want to give them a better work-life balance, we should give them incentives to remain in their positions, because we lose nurses each year. We lost 1 100 health care sector workers last year. I wonder how many we will lose this year if this government is not up to the task, Mr. Speaker.

The government put \$29.7 million in its budget for recruitment and retention. I would like to know from the minister how much of that is allocated to retention. Can he list the various initiatives?

[*Original*]

**Hon. Mr. Fitch** (Riverview, Minister of Health, PC): Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. The member opposite is correct. There is an amount in the budget for retention, and it is \$129.5 million. That breaks down in various ways. When I do my estimates, I will be very, very specific, but in the time that I have left, let me tell you what some of those breakdowns are.

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

There is over \$100 000 for physicians who want to come to work in rural parts of New Brunswick. There is \$10 000 for nurses who want to come here to New Brunswick. The various RHAs have other incentives—up to \$5 000—for nurses who want to work in some of the areas that are most needed. I will say again that we have also increased the number of seats here in New Brunswick with the work of my colleague, the Minister of Post-Secondary Education, Training and Labour. We have reached out to other institutions that can increase the capacity here to create more RNs to help the people who are there.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. McKee** (Moncton Centre, Leader of the Official Opposition, L): Mr. Speaker, in his budget speech, the Minister of Finance and Treasury Board indicated to us that \$29.7 million has been allocated to recruitment and retention. I would like to know how much of that money is going to the retention of nurses. The minister just mentioned \$129 million and talked about recruiting physicians and other health professionals.

However, the issue of the day is the retention of nurses who are leaving the province. We know that nurses in the southeastern region will go to Amherst, as school psychologists did, because they want better salaries and working conditions. Will the Sackville Memorial Hospital close because health professionals, specifically nurses, will have left to work in Amherst?

Mr. Speaker, this will be a very serious problem if this government is not up to the task. Can the minister tell us today what initiatives the government will implement to retain our nurses?

[*Original*]

**Hon. Mr. Fitch** (Riverview, Minister of Health, PC): Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. A significant amount of work is being done with respect to improving the workplace here in New Brunswick. The Premier and I, along with others, have talked to the frontline workers, and we have heard what they are saying about scheduling, supplies, and vacation issues. Some of those issues are negotiated in the collective bargaining agreement. But there are some other things that are going to help put more individuals into the system, which will alleviate the stress and strain on those shifts that do not have the full complement of people in the house. Let me talk about some of those things.

The government has funded 85 new seats in the program for bridging LPNs to RNs at UNB and UdeM. That will provide another opportunity for people to gain their RN training. There were 24 seats in the province prior to the increase. There are now a total of 105 seats. That is real, and that is going to alleviate these issues that we are talking about.

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

### BUDGET

**Mr. Legacy** (Bathurst West-Beresford, L): Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I know that the minister must have some talking points on his budget that he wants to bring up, but before we go there, we still have a little bit of unfinished business on Q3. His big announcement in Q3 was a \$300-million super-savings account. We know that we will not find a line item on that in the budget, but I imagine that presumably, since it was out in Q3, there has been some accumulated interest. So I am wondering whether the minister can tell us where that line item is. What in the budget was chosen for that money to be used to help?

**Hon. Mr. Steeves** (Moncton Northwest, Minister of Finance and Treasury Board, PC): Yes, thank you. The New Brunswick Advantage Savings Fund is new ground for us. You will absolutely find out exactly how much was raised through interest payments over the past month or two—the past six weeks. We will talk more about where that is going to go. That will be a job for Cabinet.

Do you know what? We have talked plenty. We have talked plenty about this budget. We have talked plenty about the things that will make a difference to New Brunswickers. We have talked plenty about growing the population. We have talked about cutting taxes. We have talked about raising the basic personal amount. We have talked about the minimum wage going up again on April 1, thanks to our member from Saint John. Do you know what? We have talked about the surplus. We have talked about spending 24% more since we took power back in 2018. There is 24% more spending in the budgets. We have talked about that, and we have talked about how we are servicing New Brunswick and how we are saving the economy. Who knows where we would be if that group had taken care of it? Oh, my goodness. Oh, my goodness.

**Mr. Speaker** (Hon. Mr. Oliver): Time, minister.

**Mr. Legacy** (Bathurst West-Beresford, L): Well, I called that one. He even had a chance to quip on our Liberal...

Let's go back to the savings account. This is just moving money into a liquidity account, and presumably there are different amounts in a year, probably at around \$3 billion. With regard to what is left in the liquidity account, what is being done with that interest? Why is that interest not being used for whatever projects are being used?

Also, since I have a couple of seconds, in just a weird twist of irony, the Minister of Health has \$30 million for recruitment, the Minister of Finance has created a \$300-million savings account, and Nova Scotia has about \$300 million for recruitment. This is just a weird, awful twist of irony. Talk about choices.

But can you tell me about the liquidity? What are you doing with the interest on that account? Where is it going?



# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

**Hon. Mr. Steeves** (Moncton Northwest, Minister of Finance and Treasury Board, PC): Mr. Speaker, I would ask that we change the thought there because the money in Nova Scotia was certainly not for recruitment. You mentioned that it was for recruitment, and it certainly was not.

You know what? Budgets involve hard decisions, and the New Brunswick Advantage Savings Fund is going to help us along the way. How is it going to help us? It is going to help us, once again, with Health. The Department of Health inches up by 10.6%. The Department of Health now has a budget of \$3.6 billion. The Department of Social Development is up by 11.3%. It is going to help us with social assistance rates, which are up by 7.3%, and I set them at 7%. Overall, the Department of Social Development is up by 11.3%. I am sorry about that, minister. The Department of Education is up by 9.4%. That is how the money is going to help us.

We have made strategic decisions all along. We have taken New Brunswick on a path to success, which is not where it was going with those guys. We have taken the province on a path to success to improve their lives, and we continue to do so. This government will continue with surpluses, with balancing the budget, and...

**Mr. Speaker** (Hon. Mr. Oliver): Time, minister.

**Mr. Legacy** (Bathurst West-Beresford, L): Mr. Speaker, what this minister does not understand is that right now, New Brunswickers are struggling with trying to find ways to pay for food, for clothing, and for lodging. And you guys have so much money that you are creating a savings account. How lucky would they be to be able to choose to create a savings account?

What I have not heard is that this fund is going to have a line item. It is just going to be thrown in there with everything else. And we know what happens with that. It just goes on the debt because you guys cannot figure out where to put it. So where is the line item going to show up in this budget? It is not in this year's, and you already have interest. Where is it going to be next year?

**Hon. Mr. Higgs** (Quispamsis, Premier, Minister responsible for Intergovernmental Affairs, PC): Mr. Speaker, I think that it is appropriate to talk a little about why we are where we are right now and the federal policies that got us here. We have seen the recession numbers come down a little bit, but then the interest rates went up a little bit. So the rate will probably be about the same.

But we see grocery prices at 10%, and that group over there continues to rag on about it and ask what we are going to do about it. Well, I would say that maybe we should put a motion on the floor, to unanimously approve, to request that the federal government not implement the next round of clean fuel standard taxes that will see, this summer, an increase in fuel costs, which will go up by another 10¢ or 15¢. Then we will wonder why

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

groceries have gone up. We will wonder why we cannot afford to get to work. The group over there knows that their cousins in Ottawa are driving people toward not being able to work, because they cannot afford to, with the taxes that keep coming from the federal policies. So let's have a joint agreement, and let's deal with the outfit in Ottawa that is putting our economy at risk. Thank you very much.

[*Translation*]

### CULTURE

**Ms. Thériault** (Caraquet, L): Mr. Speaker, the budget tabled Tuesday completely disregards arts and culture. We see no significant investment in this sector and we are extremely worried.

While our neighbours in Quebec, for example, are announcing \$561 million over five years, here, in New Brunswick, the total budget for arts and culture is just \$14 million, barely 19% of the department's budget. The chronic underfunding of the arts and culture sector threatens the ability of artists and organizations to grow and prosper in New Brunswick.

Madam Minister of Tourism, Heritage and Culture, this is the message you are sending: Arts and culture are not important. Is that correct?

[*Original*]

**Hon. Ms. Scott-Wallace** (Sussex-Fundy-St. Martins, Minister of Tourism, Heritage and Culture, Minister responsible for Women's Equality, PC): Well, Mr. Speaker, most certainly, the message that we are sending is that the arts are, for the first time, very, very important. I have to reflect on the status of the artist report that we, as a government, have actually picked up and are really pursuing right now with the work of artists and with a lot of work by our transition committee of artists.

Mr. Speaker, this is not a small job. We are trying to elevate artists, the professional artists. We are trying to secure them socially and economically. This is something that has absolutely never been done. There was a report being created. A previous Conservative government got the ball rolling on that. It stalled for years. We got it going again, and we are working with our artists. Thank you.

[*Translation*]

**Ms. Thériault** (Caraquet, L): Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I do not know what planet this government is living on. You must get the same news as we do and the same press releases that stakeholders send us.

Stakeholders are not happy. They are worried. Last year, you promised, among other things, to increase the film industry's budget to \$20 million by 2026, with investments



## Oral Questions

being made each year. What a surprise it was for us this week to see that there was no investment in film.

The film industry in New Brunswick is appalled. It was counting on your commitment to attract major productions and create jobs and economic opportunities for our local communities. One wonders if this government understands the immeasurable value the arts and culture sector has in the social and economic development the minister is talking about. So, Madam Minister, can you give us an update on the film situation? Thank you.

[*Original*]

**Hon. Ms. Scott-Wallace** (Sussex-Fundy-St. Martins, Minister of Tourism, Heritage and Culture, Minister responsible for Women's Equality, PC): Mr. Speaker, certainly, our relationship with the film industry is one that is important to us because we see a world of potential here in New Brunswick to attract filmmakers and actors. That is really important to us. Further details will be in our main estimates. However, last year, we doubled our budget for film. That created 29 film productions last year. That was a major step forward. What is also happening is that the film producers are organizing themselves into an organization—an association—for the first time. We believe in the film industry and in the potential in the province. We know what we have to offer to that industry. Mr. Speaker, we will learn more in main estimates relating to the arts. Thanks.

[*Translation*]

### ENVIRONMENTAL TRUST FUND

**Mr. LePage** (Restigouche West, L): Thank you, Mr. Speaker. We know that a number of good projects submitted to the Environmental Trust Fund have still not been approved or, of course, have not received the funding requested. According to the Auditor General, the eligibility criteria are not clearly defined, there is no standardized method for evaluating project funding, and the department has no documented strategic or annual plan for the Environmental Trust Fund.

Can the Minister of Environment and Climate Change—to whom I send regards and wish a speedy recovery, of course—clarify the eligibility criteria for the five priority sectors of the fund this year for us?

[*Original*]

**Hon. Mr. Crossman** (Hampton, Minister of Environment and Climate Change, PC): Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, and thank you to the member opposite for the question. To the best of my knowledge, the five priority areas—unless they have changed in the past little while—are protecting the environment, increasing environmental awareness, managing waste, addressing climate change, and building sustainable communities. There will be an

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

announcement coming soon regarding the Environmental Trust Fund. We met yesterday. An announcement on those projects will now probably be coming in early April. There are well over 300 projects again. They are very transparent.

I will tell you up front that I appreciate the work that the staff is doing, and I salute the projects out there. Certainly, if you do not apply, you are not going to be considered. I have asked for projects to be broken down by region or by riding because some certainly have more need than others if they are dealing with coastal erosion, land erosion, or other things. Our government is certainly committed to protecting, preserving, and enhancing the province's natural environment by funding grassroots environmental projects and through education, mitigation...

**Mr. Speaker** (Hon. Mr. Oliver): Time, minister.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. LePage** (Restigouche West, L): Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I know the areas. What we want to know is what evaluation criteria the minister decided to establish. The Auditor General said that there are no criteria or that they are not well done. They have to be reviewed. Has the minister reviewed the criteria? If so, what other criteria were added to determine whether projects will be accepted this year?

[*Original*]

**Hon. Mr. Crossman** (Hampton, Minister of Environment and Climate Change, PC): Mr. Speaker, thank you once again for the question from across the way. Certainly, the criteria have been identified and have been modified, and this work is ongoing. We are looking for more changes as well. One thing the Auditor General mentioned is the timeline with respect to applying not just once a year. The department is looking into that. Decisions have not been made as of today, but discussions continue. Hopefully, some of those changes will be implemented soon. Some were already implemented during the selection process. You will hear more about that in early April when they come out.

As I said earlier, the three main areas are adaptation, mitigation, and education. The education goes from kindergarten through to the postsecondary level. There are a lot of great projects out there. I will not give you the names of the individual projects here. The majority of the applications come from the Fredericton area, probably because that is where the application writers or the groups that they represent come from. Certainly, it is a fair process. Those Auditor General's report recommendations will be identified and moved ahead.

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

[*Translation*]

**Mr. LePage** (Restigouche West, L): Thank you, but I would have liked a clear answer on which criteria were modified. What are these criteria?

It is too bad that the criteria the minister uses to approve projects are only revealed after their approval. The minister is in the middle of the evaluation process. It would have been good to know... The individuals and organizations that submitted projects would have liked to know what criteria the evaluations were based on. Unfortunately, the assumption is that these answers will not come out until after the chosen projects are announced, and, again, the minister will probably favour certain regions.

Mr. Speaker, what really worries me is the number of projects received this year and how much the minister intends to spend or invest in this fund in 2023–2024, because I cannot find that information in the budget.

[*Original*]

**Hon. Mr. Crossman** (Hampton, Minister of Environment and Climate Change, PC): The money stays about the same. It is around \$9 million. There will be some slippage room in there as well. All areas are identified when people apply. In the past, you had only the November application timeline. We are looking to change that to other ways. The question I had yesterday was whether it could be multiple years. That is one of the questions that was brought up. It is a possibility. It is being discussed.

They have not been identified precisely and signed off on, so I cannot discuss them today.

All your questions are great. Hopefully, some of the answers and solutions will be forthcoming to help the people who have applied under the Environmental Trust Fund. It is great money, and there are great projects through, as I mentioned, mitigation, adaptation, and education. Education is second to none. It is great money to have in there, for the right reasons. It is even tied in with students in SEED, the Student Employment Experience Development program, for projects that carry over into the summer months.

## ENVIRONMENT

**Ms. Mitton** (Memramcook-Tantramar, G): Mr. Speaker, on Monday, the UN Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change released its final warning. We need to act now to avoid the worst impacts of climate change. Its call is clear. The time for incremental progress is over. We need to rapidly change our society and our lifestyles to secure a livable future. The IPCC has also been clear that there can be no new fossil fuel infrastructure. This means no new pipelines, no new fracking for gas, and no new LNG export terminals. Instead of getting stuck in the dying sunset industries of decades past, we



# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

need to move bravely into a renewable future. Quebec recognized this last year by banning all future fossil fuel development.

Considering the dire warning of the IPCC report that was released on Monday, will the Premier take the necessary action of banning any new fossil fuel development here in New Brunswick?

**Hon. Mr. Crossman** (Hampton, Minister of Environment and Climate Change, PC): To the member opposite, thank you very much for the question, Mr. Speaker. We are certainly looking at all fossil fuel reductions over time, and you know that as well as or more than most. We are looking at other energies as well regarding the use of hydrogen or windmills, which apparently, with the most recent storm would not have helped us a great deal.

Things are ongoing right now. That means that we are taking action. We cannot solve the world's problems. There are countries that are doing less than we are. We are doing a lot here in New Brunswick. I would like to assure the member opposite and everyone else in the House that we are taking action against climate change in order to make a positive difference.

I drive an electric car myself. How far does it go? I will get back to you next month.

(Interjections.)

**Hon. Mr. Crossman** (Hampton, Minister of Environment and Climate Change, PC): Maybe not, he said. That is certainly an education in itself.

Our new plan does include 30 focused, measurable actions with deliverables. We are working on it. We are working hard, and it is ongoing. It is not put on the back burner.

**Ms. Mitton** (Memramcook-Tantramar, G): Mr. Speaker, the whole point is that we do not have a lot of time.

(Interjections.)

**Ms. Mitton** (Memramcook-Tantramar, G): It is not nonsense. We do not have time.

Yes, okay, so the Minister of Environment and Climate Change has an electric vehicle. That is not going to solve our problems. The Premier wants to frack in this province. Mr. Speaker, the Premier has a one-track mind. It is stuck in the seventies. Time and time again, we have seen him living in a fantasy land, shilling for fossil fuel projects that even fossil fuel companies have abandoned. First, it was the Energy East Pipeline, which he insisted needed to be built even after TransCanada said that the project was dead. Then he lifted the moratorium on fracking in the Sussex area without consulting First Nations. Four years

# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

later, despite the Premier's insistence otherwise, nobody is interested in exploring shale gas in New Brunswick.

(Interjections.)

**Mr. Speaker** (Hon. Mr. Oliver): Order.

**Ms. Mitton** (Memramcook-Tantramar, G): The Premier's pet project is the LNG export terminal, despite Repsol's insistence that it is not economically feasible. Will the Premier finally admit that it is time to move on from fossil fuels?

**Hon. Mr. Higgs** (Quispamsis, Premier, Minister responsible for Intergovernmental Affairs, PC): Mr. Speaker, back about a month ago when we had the -40°C weather, it was the first time in history that Quebec shut us off to its electricity. We had never seen that before. Fortunately, we had Lepreau up and running, we had Belledune up and running, and we had Coleson Cove up and running. We had the gas plants up and running. We had all hands on deck. But do you know that the windmills were up and running? Everybody thought, Boy they are doing well because the wind is blowing really hard. But it was too hard for them. Many of them shut down because they just cannot generate in high winds.

Mr. Speaker, I appreciate the member opposite and all the issues that we are facing, but the reality is that they do not want nuclear either. The gap is huge. The transmission requirements are real. I think that the point is that it is time for a reality check that goes beyond the talk and gets into the reality of how we can have energy security going forward, not only for our province but for the world. And we want to dig up every site to try to find minerals for batteries, because that is what it is going to take, and it is a mission impossible, Mr. Speaker. Thank you.

**Ms. Mitton** (Memramcook-Tantramar, G): Yes, Mr. Speaker, let's look at the reality. Let's look at what the science says. It requires action. It requires getting off fossil fuels. It requires no new fossil fuel infrastructure. Imagine if past governments had invested more in solar, in wind, or in batteries! What if this government really invested in energy efficiency? But, no, this Premier is out of touch. He talks about the energy transition but does not understand what is necessary for a livable future for our children and our grandchildren.

The IPCC issued its final warning on Monday. Instead, we are going to keep barreling down the highway toward climate hell. There have been climate strikes across the province. Unfortunately, I did not see any of the Conservative MLAs at the climate strike that was here on Tuesday. The Premier was not there. The Minister of Environment and Climate Change was not there. That shows that climate change is not really a priority for this government. Since the Premier refused to answer my question on Wednesday, I will ask it again. Does he agree with declaring a climate change emergency?



# Legislative Assembly of New Brunswick

## Oral Questions

**Hon. Mr. Higgs** (Quispamsis, Premier, Minister responsible for Intergovernmental Affairs, PC): Mr. Speaker, there is no question that the climate is changing. We all see it. We see it every winter. We see it every spring. We see it constantly. There is no question about that. The challenge is how we react and how we manage through this.

In our case, the federal government decided that it will penalize everybody. How is that working for us? On the carbon tax, we were spending all of that on climate action items or tax reductions. Every dime from the carbon tax was spent on tax reductions or climate action projects—every dime. But it is now going out in monthly cheques because the federal government imposed the backstop. How much do you think is going to change with climate usage because of that?

We put over \$300 million into a home heating program for heat pumps, Mr. Speaker, so there is a process here. The honourable member opposite needs to understand the reality of what is going to cause us to have enough energy to survive and thrive. The holes that she does not speak about are real. Let's get all the facts on the table.

**Mr. Speaker** (Hon. Mr. Oliver): Question period has ended.

